

# Ice or Snow in the Tempel 1 Comet?

**Nicola M. Pugno**

Department of Structural Engineering,  
Politecnico di Torino, Corso Duca degli Abruzzi 24,  
10129 Torino, Italy  
e-mail: nicola.pugno@polito.it

*An estimation of the Tempel 1 comet strength is deduced as intermediate between that of snow and ice.* [DOI: 10.1115/1.2127958]

On July 4, 2005 NASA celebrated the success of the mission *Deep Impact*, culminated with the impact of a ballistic projectile on the *Tempel 1* comet. The projectile, with a mass of  $m \sim 370$  Kg, hit the target at a (relative) velocity of  $v \sim 37\,000$  Km/h creating a crater of  $r \sim 100$  m in radius and  $h \sim 40$  m in height.

Material scientists would be happy to measure the mechanical strength  $\sigma_C$  of the comet material, as well as the other solid heavenly bodies. The extraction of specimens for such a purpose has

---

Contributed by the Applied Mechanics Division of ASME for publication in the *JOURNAL OF APPLIED MECHANICS*. Manuscript received July 9, 2005; final manuscript received September 22, 2005. Review conducted by R. M. McMeeking.

not been realized until now. In spite of this, an estimation of the comet strength can be easily deduced by the following procedure. The kinetic energy  $K$  available in the collision is proportional to a power of the crater volume  $V$  with a fractional exponent [1]. For example, according to the Gault's scaling [2], assuming geometrical self-similarity (i.e.,  $h \propto r$ ) we deduce 1.19 from the lunar crater data. In particular, for large-sized fragmentations the exponent is close to the unity and the constant of proportionality to the mechanical strength of the comminuted material [3]. Thus, from the previous reported experimental observations we can estimate the mechanical strength of the *Tempel 1* comet, to be around

$$\sigma_C \approx \frac{K}{V} = \frac{1/2mv^2}{\pi h/2(r^2 + h^2/3)} \approx 30 \text{ kPa} \quad (1)$$

This value is in between that of terrestrial snows ( $\sim 1-10$  kPa) and ice ( $\sim 1000$  kPa).

To have an idea of such strengths, note that the last value corresponds to the fracture of an ice cubelet just under the weight of a middle-sized man, as can be easily verified in our own home.

## References

- [1] Carpinteri, A., and Pugno, N., 2002, "One-, two- and Three-Dimensional Universal Laws for Fragmentation due to Impact and Explosion," *ASME J. Appl. Mech.*, **69**, pp. 854-856.
- [2] Gault, D., 1974, "Impact Cratering," *Primer of Lunar Geology*, R. Greeley and P. Schultz, eds., NASA Ames Report, pp. 137-175.
- [3] Carpinteri, A., and Pugno, N., 2002, "A Fractal Comminution Approach to Evaluate the Drilling Energy Dissipation," *Int. J. Numer. Analyt. Meth. Geomech.*, **26**, pp. 499-513.